



U.S. Department
Of Transportation
**Federal Transit
Administration**

Region 02
New York
New Jersey

One Bowling Green
Room 429
New York, NY 10004-1415
212-668-2170
212-668-2136 (Fax)

April 19, 2019

Ms. Veronique "Ronnie" Hakim
Managing Director
Metropolitan Transportation Authority
2 Broadway
New York, NY 10004

Subject: Environmental Re-Evaluation for Metropolitan Transportation Authority New York City Transit
Canarsie Tunnel Project

Dear Ms. Hakim:

~~Dear Ms. Hakim:~~ *RONNIE:*
Thank you for revising and resubmitting the *Environmental Re-Evaluation Consultation form for the Canarsie Tunnel Project: Revised Alternative Service Plan (ASP), Revised Construction Means and Methods, and Extended Work Hours (Re-Evaluation)*, originally submitted to the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) on March 1, 2019, regarding the Metropolitan Transportation Authority New York City Transit (MTA NYCT) Canarsie Tunnel Project (Project) for Hurricane Sandy-related repairs and other activities taking advantage of a partial tunnel closure. FTA has completed its review of the MTA NYCT's Re-Evaluation as revised, dated April 17, 2019, as well as the accompanying transmittal letter. As part of the Project, MTA NYCT proposes to make changes to the following elements of the Project:

- (1) The alternative service plan that FTA approved with the September 2018 Finding of No Significant Impact on the MTA NYCT Canarsie Tunnel Project Alternative Service Plan as described in the July 2018 Supplemental Environmental Assessment;
- (2) Tunnel construction means and methods associated with the Categorical Exclusions (CE) FTA issued for Canarsie Tube Restoration (CE(c)(8)) and Canarsie Tube Resiliency (CE(c)(3)) in February 2015; and
- (3) Surface-level construction work hours associated with the CEs FTA issued for Canarsie Tube Restoration and Resiliency in February 2015 as well as for Canarsie Core Capacity and State of Good Repair (CE(d)(6)) in August 2016.

The Re-Evaluation was submitted to provide information on potential impacts of the proposed changes to determine if the changed Project will result in significant environmental impacts and to provide information requested by the FTA in an October 10, 2018 letter. MTA NYCT's Re-Evaluation concluded that the proposed changes to construction means and methods and construction work hours are consistent with the approved CEs and would not result in any significant environmental impacts, that the proposed changes to the ASP would not result in any significant impacts, that the previous environmental determinations remain valid and recommended no supplemental environmental review be required.

Based on our independent review of the Re-Evaluation, attached hereto, FTA concurs that the proposed changes to the Project, as described in the Re-Evaluation, will not result in significant adverse environmental impacts. The completed Re-Evaluation document satisfies the NEPA requirements as outlined in 23 C.F.R. § 771.129 and no supplemental environmental review is necessary for the proposed changes. FTA affirms the previous environmental decision documents associated with the Canarsie Tunnel Project remain valid.

As already noted in the Re-Evaluation, for those temporary elements that were partially installed or already implemented in anticipation of a full-tunnel closure, but that are no longer part of the Project, MTA NYCT, in coordination with other agencies, as applicable, have indicated they will determine independent utility and will comply with applicable planning and implementation requirements for those elements.

Going forward, if any further changes to the Project are proposed, MTA must notify the FTA in writing prior to implementing the change so that FTA can determine whether additional environmental studies or analysis will be necessary before the changes are approved. Should you have any questions concerning this Project, please contact me at 212-668-2170.

Sincerely,



Stephen Goodman, P.E.
Regional Administrator

Enclosures: MTA NYCT's *Environmental Re-Evaluation Consultation form for the Canarsie Tunnel Project: Revised Alternative Service Plan (ASP), Revised Construction Means and Methods, and Extended Work Hours, dated April 17, 2019.*

FTA Memorandum, dated April 18, 2019

cc. Donald Spero, MTAHQ
Stephanie DeLisle, MTAHQ
Lou Oliva, MTAHQ
Matt Best, MTACC
Robert Conway, MTACC
Jennifer Woutinen, MTACC
Naomi Renek, MTA NYCT
Angelo Elmi, MTA NYCT
Deneisha Cox, MTA NYCT
Judy McClain, MTA NYCT
Joseph Ehrlich, MTA NYCT
David Farber, MTA NYCT
Branko Kleva, MTA NYCT
Nina Chung, FTA
Donald Burns, FTA
Donovan Vincent, FTA
Hans, Pointdujour, FTA
Charles, Dyer, FTA