# 8. Historic and Cultural Resources

# 8.1 INTRODUCTION

As a project requiring FHWA approval, the CBD Tolling Program is an undertaking subject to review under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) of 1966, as amended, and its implementing regulations, 36 CFR Part 800. This chapter documents the steps taken to comply with Section 106 review and consultation and summarizes the assessment of effects on historic properties, as identified through the Section 106 process and contained in the Section 106 Finding Documentation prepared for the Project (see **Appendix 8, "Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation"**).

In addition, because the Project is subject to review by FHWA, it must also comply with Section 4(f) of the U.S. Department of Transportation Act of 1966. Section 4(f) stipulates that FHWA may not approve the use of Section 4(f) properties unless they have determined that certain conditions apply. **Chapter 19**, **"Section 4(f) Evaluation,"** of this Environmental Assessment provides an evaluation of the Project's consistency with the requirements of Section 4(f) regarding historic sites.

# 8.2 SECTION 106 PROCESS

The Section 106 process includes the following steps:

- Initiation with State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), Federally recognized Native American tribes, and other Consulting Parties
- Definition of the Area of Potential Effect (APE) for the build alternatives
- Identification of historic properties in the APE
- Evaluation of effects on historic properties in the APE
- Consideration of measures to avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse effects if present
- Documentation of assessment of effects on historic properties
- Consultation to avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse effects, if present, with agreed upon measures typically stipulated in a memorandum of agreement

# 8.3 IDENTIFICATION OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES

Identification of historic properties was conducted in accordance with the requirements of 36 CFR Part 800 for implementing Section 106 of the NHPA and in consultation with the SHPO. As noted above, historic properties include any district, site, building, structure, or object listed in or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) (36 CFR Section 800.16(I1)). Although Section 106 applies to NRHP-listed or eligible properties, properties designated New York City landmarks have been included. All but two of the identified New York City landmarks also have NRHP designations.

As part of Section 106 consultation, a Cultural Resources Screening Report prepared in October 2021 was provided to the SHPO and to the four Federally recognized Native American tribes participating in the Section 106 process. The screening identified known historic properties and assessed archaeological sensitivity and prior disturbance within a study area that included areas immediately surrounding the proposed detection points and signage locations. Based on the scope of work and the results of the screening, the report recommends that no survey for architectural resources was warranted and concludes that extensive prior disturbance has reduced the archaeological potential such that the presence of intact archaeological deposits is highly unlikely within the very limited areas of ground disturbance proposed by the Project. Thus, no archaeological survey was recommended. In correspondence dated November 22, 2021, the SHPO identified two additional historic properties and concurred with the recommendations that no further architectural and archaeological surveys are warranted (see correspondence in **Appendix 8**, **"Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation"**).

The APE for an undertaking as defined by 36 CFR Section 800.16(d) represents:

[T]he geographic area or areas within which an undertaking may directly or indirectly cause alterations in the character or use of historic properties [i.e., NRHP-eligible resources] if any such properties exist. The area of potential effects is influenced by the scale and nature of an undertaking and may be different for different kinds of effects caused by the undertaking.<sup>1</sup>

The October 2021 screening described a proposed APE. In accordance with 36 CFR Section 800.4(a)(1), an APE was defined for the Project based on proposed work activities associated with the CBD Tolling Alternative and the potential to affect historic properties, including potential direct and indirect effects caused by the construction and operation of the Project. The APE for the Project was based on a proposed scope of work that includes the following items:

- Installation of new poles with tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment on city streets and other at-grade roadways, including poles in new locations and replacement poles in the same locations
- Mounting of new poles and tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment directly on bridge and tunnel structures

In correspondence dated November 22, 2021, the SHPO concurred with the APE.

The APE for the Project consists of noncontiguous areas representing the areas of potential direct and indirect effects associated with the installation of new tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment and is mapped in **Figure 8-1** and described and mapped in greater detail in **Appendix 8**, **"Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation."** 

Information on resources listed in or determined eligible for listing in the NRHP was collected from the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation's Cultural Resource Information System (CRIS). The NPS's list of NHLs was reviewed, and properties that New York City Landmarks Preservation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended 2004 (54 United States Code Section 300108, 2015).

Commission (LPC) has designated (or considered eligible for such designation) as individual New York City Landmarks and Scenic Landmarks (NYCLs) or New York City Historic Districts (NYCHDs) were identified. A review of the CRIS identified 45 historic properties within the APE. The properties consist of architectural resources, including buildings, structures, and districts.

## 8.4 ASSESSMENT OF EFFECTS

#### 8.4.1 No Action Alternative

The No Action Alternative would not result in a vehicular tolling program; therefore, it would not involve the installation of tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment. The No Action Alternative would not result in any physical changes in the APE and therefore would not result in any direct or indirect effects to historic properties.

## 8.4.2 CBD Tolling Alternative

The Project's effects on historic properties were assessed as part of the Section 106 Finding Documentation (see **Appendix 8, "Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation"**). **Table 8-1** provides a description of the historic architectural properties in the APE and a summary of the Project's changes on or near the properties.

Within the APE, the CBD Tolling Alternative would result in new tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment (i.e., cameras and E-ZPass readers) on the structural elements at two historic bridges—the Ed Koch Queensboro Bridge and the Manhattan Bridge—and at the Manhattan portals of the Lincoln Tunnel. In addition, the CBD Tolling Alternative would place new tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment on the underside of the High Line, a former freight railroad viaduct. New poles with tolling system equipment mounted directly on them or from mast arms extending over the streetbeds would be installed on city streets and sidewalks and other at-grade roadways, including new poles in new locations and replacement poles in the same locations (see **Chapter 2, "Project Alternatives,"** for a description of tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment). These include poles within Central Park and historic districts and poles on the same blocks as individual historic properties. (Refer to **Appendix 8, "Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation,"** for the specific locations of the tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment.)

As summarized above and described in the Section 106 Finding Documentation, the CBD Tolling Alternative would result in minor changes to the affected historic bridges, tunnel, and High Line structure. It would not alter the historic characteristics of historic districts and would result in minimal changes to the settings of individual historic properties in the APE. The CBD Tolling Alternative would not result in changes that would alter the characteristics that qualify historic properties for listing in the NRHP, nor would it diminish the integrity of any historic property's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association, including the three NHLs in the APE: the Holland Tunnel, the McGraw-Hill Publishing Company Building, and Central Park.



Figure 8-1. Overview of Area of Potential Effects

Source: ArcGIS Online, <u>https://www.arcgis.com/index.html</u>.

ADDRESS/NAME	DESCRIPTION	STATUS & NRHP CRITERIA <sup>1, 2</sup>	CHANGES	EFFECT
Ed Koch Queensboro Bridge	Constructed in 1901-1908, the Ed Koch Queensboro Bridge is a two-span, through cantilever truss bridge spanning the East River from Manhattan to Queens.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, C</li> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of tolling equipment on bridge structure</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Manhattan Bridge <sup>3</sup>	This steel suspension bridge spanning the East River from the Lower East Side of Manhattan to Brooklyn opened in 1909; it is supported by two steel towers and includes a stone colonnade at the Manhattan approach.	<ul><li>NRHP-Listed, C</li><li>NYCL</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of steel girder with tolling equipment</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
South Street Seaport Historic District and Extension	The South Street Seaport Historic District and Extension contains the largest concentration of early 19th century commercial buildings in New York City.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCHD</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of a pole with equipment cabinet in a parking lot</li> <li>Minor change to setting</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Holland Tunnel	Opened in 1927, the Holland Tunnel is the first subaqueous tunnel in the world; its two tubes carry traffic to and from Manhattan and New Jersey below the Hudson River.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, C</li> <li>NHL</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes to tunnel structure</li><li>Minor change to setting</li></ul>	No effect
Tribeca North Historic District (NRHP)	This district is defined by many large warehouse buildings constructed mostly between 1880 and 1910.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCHD</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of one new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment in location of existing sidewalk light pole</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Tribeca North Historic District (NYCHD)			<ul> <li>Minor change to setting</li> </ul>	
Tribeca West Historic District	This district is defined by commercial buildings constructed between 1860 and the 1920s; row houses from the early 19th century; as well as office, garages, institutional, and civic buildings constructed from after the Civil War to 1931.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCHD</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
American Thread Building	This 11-story, Renaissance Revival-style commercial building faced in brown brick was constructed from 1894 to 1896 and designed by architect, William B. Tubby.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
Whitehall Building	This 20-story, Beaux Arts-style building was designed by architect Henry Hardenbergh and completed in 1904. The 31-story addition was designed by the architectural firm Clinton and Russell and built in 1908. The building has a stone base with brick cladding above.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, C</li> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect

## Table 8-1. Historic Properties and Summary of Changes

ADDRESS/NAME	DESCRIPTION	STATUS & NRHP CRITERIA <sup>1, 2</sup>	CHANGES	EFFECT
Downtown Athletic Club Building	Constructed in 1930 as a skyscraper clubhouse, the Downtown Athletic Club was designed by Starrett & Van Vleck. The Art Deco-style building features irregular massing and mottled orange brick cladding.	<ul> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
21 West Street	This 32-story, Art Deco-style skyscraper was designed by Starrett & Van Vleck and constructed from 1929 to 1931; the building is faced with tan and dark-brown brick.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
U.S. Post Office – Morgan General Mail Facility	Constructed in 1933, the Morgan General Mail Facility is a 6- to 10-story building built in the Art Deco style. The building's exterior is faced in limestone block on the lower levels with brick above.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCL-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalks</li> </ul>	No effect
406-426 West 31st Street <sup>3</sup>	Constructed in 1914, the 16-story building is symmetrically fenestrated and faced in brick.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect
U.S. General Post Office	The 6- and 10-story, Art Deco-style building was built in 1933 under the design of architect James A. Wetmore. The building is faced in granite ashlar.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
Pennsylvania Railroad North River Tunnel (used by Amtrak and NJ TRANSIT)	Built between 1904 and 1908, the North River Tunnel carries train traffic in two tubes beneath the Hudson River between Penn Station New York and New Jersey.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>No changes to immediate setting</li> </ul>	No effect
St. Michael's Roman Catholic Church Complex <sup>2</sup>	Completed in 1907, the complex includes a Romanesque-style church, school, convent, and rectory. The complex was designed by Napoleon LeBrun & Sons.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> <li>NYCL-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect
Master Printers Building <sup>2</sup>	Completed in 1927, the 19-story building was designed by architects Parker & Shaffer and clad in tan brick.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
Webster Apartments <sup>2</sup>	The C-shaped building was constructed in 1923. The Neo-Classical style building rises 13 stories and is clad in red brick.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect

ADDRESS/NAME	DESCRIPTION	STATUS & NRHP CRITERIA <sup>1,2</sup>	CHANGES	EFFECT
Harding Building/ Garment Center Historic District <sup>4</sup>	Designed by architect Chester J. Storm and constructed from 1926 to 1927, the 17-story building contributes to the Garment Center Historic District, which includes industrial, residential, religious, and government buildings dating from 1858 to 1958.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
Paddy's Market Historic District	Ninth Avenue between West 38th and West 42nd Streets was the location of one of the best-known pushcart markets, located beneath the former rail viaduct. The buildings in this potential historic district are primarily late 19th century tenements with many retaining intact storefronts that reflect the history of the market.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of two new poles with mast arms with tolling equipment on sidewalk</li> <li>Minor change to setting</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Former Pinehill Crystal Water Company <sup>2</sup>	The 6-story building, constructed in 1911, is faced in tan brick with stone detailing.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
Hill Building <sup>2</sup>	Constructed in 1914, the 14-story building is designed in the Neo-Classical style. The building is clad in terra- cotta and brick.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
500 West 37th Street <sup>2</sup>	The 6-story building was constructed in 1890. Symmetrically fenestrated, the building is faced in red brick with a stone façade on the ground floor along Tenth Avenue.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
Underhill Building <sup>2</sup>	Designed by Hill & Stout, the 13-story building was constructed in 1915. The building is clad in red brick with decorative glazed terra-cotta.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
408 West 39th Street <sup>2</sup>	The 5-story tenement building comprises details from the Neo-Grec and Romanesque Revival styles. The ground floor is faced with brownstone with an intact cornice.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect
523-539 Ninth Avenue <sup>2</sup>	The nine, 4-story tenement buildings along Ninth Avenue are faced in brick. The buildings' cornices are intact with stone lintels and windowsills.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on same block</li> </ul>	No effect

ADDRESS/NAME	DESCRIPTION	STATUS & NRHP CRITERIA <sup>1, 2</sup>	CHANGES	EFFECT
Lincoln Tunnel	Completed after the Holland Tunnel, the Lincoln Tunnel has three tubes for vehicles to travel below the Hudson River between Manhattan and New Jersey. The north tube was completed in 1945, the center tube in 1937, and the south tube in 1957.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of tolling equipment at the three portal structures</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
St. Raphael Roman Catholic Church and Rectory <sup>2</sup>	The church and rectory are designed in the Gothic Revival style with stone and red brick.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
500-506 West 42nd Street <sup>2</sup>	The two, 6-story tenement buildings are clad in tan brick. A metal balcony runs just below the 6th-floor windows.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect
McGraw-Hill Publishing Company Building	Designed by architect Raymond Hood, the 33-story building was constructed in 1930. The building is faced in panels that are painted a deep blue-green and includes horizontal bands of windows.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> <li>NHL</li> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
The High Line	The 1.45-mile-long elevated steel and concrete viaduct structure was built by the New York Central Railroad to replace its on-grade Tenth Avenue tracks. It runs roughly parallel to Tenth Avenue between West 34th and Gansevoort Streets.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of tolling equipment on underside of viaduct structure</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Former French Hospital <sup>2</sup>	The 13-story building was built 1927–1928 by the French Benevolent Society as the New York City French Hospital. The building is clad in brick with a 2-story stone base.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
Lithuanian Alliance of America	The 4-story Neo-Grec style building was built circa 1876 as a single-family residence by architect and real estate developer Edward E. Ashley. The building was purchased by the Lithuanian Alliance of America in 1910.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
Hotel Irwin	The 11-story Hotel Irwin opened in 1925 as an apartment building for unmarried women. The building was originally planned in 1914 for use as a hotel for women by Ms. Richard Irwin, but World War 1 delayed construction. The Classical Revival-style brick building was designed by Jackson, Rosencranz, and Waterbury.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk on same block</li> </ul>	No effect

ADDRESS/NAME	DESCRIPTION	STATUS & NRHP CRITERIA <sup>1, 2</sup>	CHANGES	EFFECT
Engine Co. 34 Firehouse	The 2-story brick firehouse was designed by Hubert J. Treacy and built in 1937. The firehouse is a representative example of the two-company/two- vehicular entrance type the New York City Fire Department began using at the turn of the 20th century.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to immediate setting</li></ul>	No effect
P.S. 191 Hudson Honors School	The 5-story building was built in 1955 and designed by William Gehron. The building has an L-shaped plan and minimized ornamentation.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect
Cova Building	The 12-story office building, built between 1922 and 1924 by Alexander Cohen, has terra-cotta ornaments and decorative metal panels.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Eligible, C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor change to setting – two new poles with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalks on same block</li> </ul>	No effect
59th Street- Columbus Circle Subway Station	Completed in 1904, the station is one of the first original Interborough Rapid Transit subway stations to be completed. The station has Beaux Arts painting and decoration.		<ul><li>No physical changes</li><li>No changes to setting</li></ul>	No effect
Central Park <sup>5</sup>	Central Park is the first large-scale public park in the nation. Created from 1857 to 1866, the park was designed by Frederick Law Olmsted and Calvert Vaux.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, C</li> <li>NYC Scenic Landmark</li> <li>NHL</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor physical changes:         <ul> <li>Replacement of four existing poles with new poles with tolling equipment at three detection locations on the interior park roads (note, access to Central Park interior roads is restricted to authorized vehicles only)</li> <li>Replacement of existing light pole with new pole with tolling equipment on Fifth Avenue sidewalk</li> <li>Installation of a new pole with mast arm on Central Park West sidewalk.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Minor changes to setting</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Upper East Side Historic District (NRHP)	This district is defined by mansions, apartment houses, and row houses in a range of architectural styles, dating from 1862 to 1938.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of one new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk</li> </ul>	No adverse effect

ADDRESS/NAME	DESCRIPTION	STATUS & NRHP CRITERIA <sup>1, 2</sup>	CHANGES	EFFECT
Upper East Side Historic District (NYCHD)		<ul> <li>NYCHD</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes to setting</li> </ul>	
Upper East Side Historic District Boundary Increase and Additional Documentation	The expansion of the original Upper East Side Historic District includes multiple domestic, religious, commercial, and government buildings with similar historic development and period integrity. The period of significance is from 1862 to 1956.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of one new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on sidewalk</li> <li>Minor changes to setting</li> </ul>	No adverse effect
Grand Army Plaza	Grand Army Plaza was laid out to the designs of Carrère & Hastings in 1913–1916. The plaza includes decorative paving and landscaped areas and is divided by 59th Street; the plaza to the south includes the Pulitzer Fountain and the plaza to the north the General Sherman Monument.	<ul> <li>NYC Scenic Landmark</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>No changes to immediate setting</li> </ul>	No effect
Public Baths	The Public Baths were built by the City of New York in 1904–1906 and designed by Arnold W. Brunner and William M. Aiken. The Public Baths are a 1-story brick building with limestone base.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCL</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>No physical changes</li> <li>Minor changes to setting – new pole with mast arm with tolling equipment on adjacent sidewalk</li> </ul>	No effect
Gansevoort Market Historic District	This district is defined by a mix of buildings typically constructed between the 1840s and 1940s linked to the city's working waterfront and includes a contributing historic street grid.	<ul> <li>NRHP-Listed, A &amp; C</li> <li>NYCHD</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Minor changes – installation of one new pole with equipment cabinet on sidewalk</li> <li>Minor change to setting</li> </ul>	No adverse effect

Source: CRIS at https://cris.parks.ny.gov; NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission "Discover NYC Landmarks" at https://www1.nyc.gov/site/lpc/index.page.

Refer to the Section 106 Finding Documentation in Appendix 8, "Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation" for more information about the potential changes associated with the CBD Tolling Alternative.

<sup>1</sup> National Register of Historic Places, Significance Criteria A through D.

<sup>2</sup> For certain properties, the SHPO's CRIS does not provide information regarding the NRHP criteria under which the properties were determined eligible; therefore, information is not provided in this table for those properties.

<sup>3</sup> The Arch and Colonnade is an NYCL. The bridge structure/deck is not an NYCL or NYCL-Eligible.

<sup>4</sup> The Harding Building is the only building in the Garment Center Historic District (NRHP-listed) that is in the APE.

<sup>5</sup> The NRHP and NYCL boundaries differ for Central Park at the location of the corner of the park at Central Park South (59th Street) and Fifth Avenue; this corner is included as part of the Grand Army Plaza Scenic Landmark but excluded from the New York City Scenic Landmark boundaries. Grand Army Plaza is included within the Central Park NRHP and NHL boundaries.

LPC = New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission

NRHP = National Register of Historic Places

NYCL = New York City Landmark and New York City Scenic Landmark

NYCHD = New York City Historic District

NHL = National Historic Landmark

The Section 106 Finding Documentation describes the identified historic properties, applies the criteria of adverse effect (36 CFR 800.5(a)(1)), and concludes that the Project would have no adverse effect on historic properties. NYSDOT provided the Draft (Proposed Final) Section 106 Finding Documentation for review by the SHPO and Consulting Parties on April 12, 2022. FHWA provided the Draft (Proposed Final) Section 106 Finding Documentation to the four Federally recognized Native American tribes with an interest in the geographical area of the Project on April 13, 2022. The SHPO concurred with the No Adverse Effect finding on April 18, 2022, and NPS concurred with the No Adverse Effect finding on May 19. 2022 (see **Appendix 8**, **"Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation"**).

Revisions were made to the Section 106 Finding Documentation based on comments received by the Consulting Parties on the Draft (Proposed Final) Finding Documentation and on the subsequent submission of information regarding the installation of tolling signage within Central Park as described in **Appendix 8**, **"Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation."** The comments were not substantive and did not alter the recommended finding. With these revisions, the Finding Documentation was considered final. Based on the consultation described in **Appendix 8**, **"Historic and Cultural Resources: Section 106 Finding Documentation**, in a letter dated June 21, 2022, the FHWA issued a No Adverse Effect determination for the Project and a determination that the requirements of 36 CFR Part 800 have been met for this undertaking. FHWA issued a No Adverse Effect determination." 2022.

# 8.4.2.1 Effects on Historic Sites Protected by Section 4(f) of the U.S. Department of Transportation Act

Because implementation of the CBD Tolling Alternative would require the placement of tolling infrastructure and tolling system within the APE and on or in proximity to historic sites or within historic districts that are NRHP-listed or NHRP-eligible sites, FHWA must evaluate the potential use of historic sites for this Project in accordance with Section 4(f) (refer to **Chapter 19**, **"Section 4(f) Evaluation")**.

## 8.5 CONCLUSION

FHWA has undertaken consultation pursuant to Section 106 to assess the Project's potential effects on historic properties. Through that process, FHWA determined that the Project would not result in any direct or indirect effects on historic properties that would alter the characteristics of a historic property that qualify it for inclusion in the NRHP, and the Project would have No Adverse Effect on historic and cultural resources. **Table 8-2** summarizes the effects of the CBD Tolling Alternative and commitments that will be undertaken by the Project Sponsors pursuant to the Section 106 consultation for the Project.

SUMMARY OF EFFECTS	EFFECT FOR ALL TOLLING SCENARIOS	POTENTIAL ADVERSE EFFECT	MITIGATION AND ENHANCEMENTS
New tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment on or near historic properties	Based on a review of the Project in accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act, FHWA has determined that the Project would have No Adverse Effect on historic properties and the State Historic Preservation Office has concurred.	No	<ul> <li>Through consultation undertaken pursuant to Section 106 of the NHPA, the Project Sponsors agreed to the following measures to avoid potential adverse effects on historic resources:</li> <li>Tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment on city streets would not be installed in front of a historic building's entrance.</li> <li>Historic or decorative sidewalk paving within historic districts would not be removed or altered to install tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment. On Fifth Avenue and Central Park West, any granite-block pavers that would be removed to install replacement poles would be reused or replaced in kind. Proposed work on sidewalks or protected paving located within historic districts designated by LPC would following guidance as set forth in Chapter 10: Historic Districts with Sidewalks Regulated by LPC of the LPC Permit Guidebook (2019).</li> <li>New light poles and associated equipment would be visually consistent with the existing palette of street furniture in the APE.</li> <li>In Central Park, new tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment would have the same appearance as the poles they would replace.</li> <li>For new tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment on the park edges (Fifth Avenue and Central Park West), place poles near the curbs consistent with the presence of modern street furniture in the area. On Central Park West, measures implemented to minimize the visual impact of the pole with a 50-foot-long mast arm include combining the disparate required elements of the tolling system equipment into single enclosures ("clusters") that are the minimum size possible (smaller than a traffic light). The proposed pole and tolling infrastructure and tolling system equipment on the street. The Memorandum of Understanding between NYCDOT and TBTA for the Project restricts any equipment other than the tolling system equipment from being installed on the pole and mast arm.</li> <li>Coordinate with NYC Parks, SHPO, and NPS regarding additional stree</li></ul>

## Table 8-2. Summary of Effects of the CBD Tolling Alternative on Historic and Cultural Resources