

Paratransit Advisory Committee (PAC)

June 29, 2023

Meeting Minutes

Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic, the PAC meeting was conducted virtually via Zoom.

1. Welcome from PAC Leadership

Meeting was called to order by Chairperson RueZalia Watkins at 5:10 pm.

2. Confirmation of participants and approval of minutes

PAC Members

Thomas Coppola, Ketrina Hazell, Billy Mitchell, Sharlene Kraft, Mark Anthony Phifer, Jean Ryan, RueZalia Watkins, Sharada Veerubhotla, Tom Coppola, Tucker Salovaara

Regrets – Jose Hernandez, Luda Demikhovskaya

Absent – Ellen Rubin, Mindy Jacobson

MTA/NYCT Paratransit

Donna Fredericksen, Eugene Griffith, Simone Harvard, Robin Hernandez, Patricia Ibarquen, Diane McFarlane, Chris Pangilinan, Tammie Francisque, Natalie Garcia, Lynda Edmond, Shari Bhushun-Ogbourne, Beverlyn Richards, Frank Camp, Scott Pantano, Daniel Rodriguez II.

Invited Guests -

Norah Orizoli, Senior Vice-President – Sales (CTG)

Eduard Slinin, CEO (CTG)

Maddie Toska, Director of IT (CTG)

Chairperson Watkins acknowledged the previous meeting minutes were approved.

3. Paratransit Dashboard AAR Report

A summary of the April 2023 operating statistics from the Paratransit Report (report on pg. 8) was sent to PAC members and reviewed by VP Chris Pangilinan.

PAC Member Discussion and Feedback

Mr. Coppola: Inquired about which broker company is located on Staten Island, are the statistics presented broken down by borough (specifically Staten Island), and if so, which borough was underperforming.

Mr. Pangilinan: Explained AAR does look at data per borough. Noted that May was the biggest victory in the Bronx, but there was also a drop there in May. Staten Island has the highest customer satisfaction. Broker company Islander (formerly called Newport) serves only S.I. trips.

Ms. Ryan: To comply with DOJ reporting, working to get data more current and in line with Subways and Buses to present together. Still working with DOJ re their suggestion to compare travel times for AAR with buses and subways.

Ms. Veerubhotla: How is AAR working on addressing the delays reported from May 2023? Noted drivers take off for summer which could affect travel time.

Mr. Pangilinan: June did see much better performance than May. Some vendors performed poorly. AAR discussed these issues with broker for April and offered financial incentives for meeting future performance goals. Summer months generally help AAR performance (more vehicles are available to us). Generally, is suppressed (no school, vacations). September becomes busier (schools back in session, U.N. Assembly, etc.). Must meet OTP of 94% at 20 minutes and must deliver less than 0.3 no shows and trip returns combined to earn this incentive bonus. Currently, they must meet 0.3 at 30 minutes for no shows only and does not factor trip returns.

Mr. Salovaara: What will happen with congestion pricing?

Mr. Pangilinan: Congestion pricing is a big topic, which could be discussed at a separate meeting. However, there are a few benefits for AAR. 1) congestion in Manhattan should be reduced south of 60th street, which can positively impact AAR OTP, and 2) will likely reduce demand on the for-hire taxi network. More drivers looking for work, the more drivers AAR will have available to perform trips, 3) should raise money that will hopefully fund projects important to MTA. One risk is if it creates more congestion north of 60th Street and along the BQE in Queens or Brooklyn, this could create more congestion. Overall, potentially a positive impact, but we will have to see how it goes.

Mr. Pangilinan: Discussed moving onto agenda item number 4, Paratransit Topic (CTG Driver Training). Offered to provide an update on the E-hail pilot program expansion, Phase 2. The Chair agreed, and the item was added to the agenda. 3,600 people (1,200 + 2,400). If numbers do not add up to 3,600, more

customers will be added to ensure it includes 3,600 active customer count. Program formerly included 3 vendors, with unlimited number of trips. New vendors being added: Uber, Driver's Cooperative, CTG, and ARRO will continue in the program. There will be 2 Programs (High Volume & Distance) and the 3,600 customers will be placed into one of the two programs, creating a random sampling of users to collect data and review.

PAC members engaged in detailed discussion with VP Pangilinan about the specific details of both programs, and the impact of each on phase I customers and phase II (expansion) customers.

VP Pangilinan: Noted tolls are currently being included in the cost to AAR customers. However, removal of this cost to customers is being explored.

Chair Watkins: Inquired about whether a cost analysis was performed to determine how much certain trips will cost above what is currently being proposed in the two programs.

VP Pangilinan: Noted that in Phase I, in March 2023, there were 22K trips taken 36% were more than \$45, and 66% were less than that (although this data may be skewed due to misuse). VP requested that Command Center Officer, Simone Harvard provide a cost analysis, with examples of various types of trips that may exceed the allotment, for PAC reference.

Ms. Kraft: How will customers know the amount charged to their credit cards for e-hail trips if their ride becomes delayed due to heavy traffic or other unavoidable circumstances?

Mr. Harvard: Noted the charge to credit cards will be noted at the time of reservation and will not change. This amount will be reflected in the vendor app and may also be provided by vendor when customer calls to book the trip.

Mr. Saalovara: MEDI drivers seemed to have the best training with assisting passengers with disabilities. Which of the Phase II companies will be most like MEDI (which is not returning)?

VP Pangilinan: The training for WAV drivers is standardized by TLC, and then some taxi companies provide an added layer of training. However, Uber will be pulling from the same driver pool as MEDI, so Uber WAV drivers should have that same training.

The vendor of customer's choice will charge customers via credit card (provided in advance) and will be not deduct that charge until after the trip has been completed.

Chair Watkins: Asked whether extra AAR dedicated vehicles will be available to provide service to customers who opt not to participate in the E-hail Pilot Phase II programs.

4. Paratransit Topic:

CTG Broker Service Update & Driver Training

Ms. Orizoli shared a PPT presentation.

Ms. Ryan: CTG drivers are failing to secure wheelchairs, don't have proper straps to secure wheelchairs, or need additional training on wheelchair securement.

Ms. Veerubhotla: Suggest doing secret monitoring of driver who are using cell phones while driving. Additionally, two separate texts are being requested for people who are blind.

Chair Watkins: Noted that such requests need to be presented across all vendors.

5. PAC Topics:

Supplemental Service Update

Mr. Daniel Rodriguez shared a PPT presentation displaying the various types of vehicles and their features.

Chair Watkins: Advised due to time constraints a request is being made to move the Diesel Vehicle Count/Replacement topic to the next meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 6:30 PM.

Paratransit Report

Statistical results for the month of April 2023 are shown below.

Paratransit Operations - Monthly Operations Report Service Indicators							
Category	Performance Indicator	Current Month: April 2023			12-Month Average		
		This Year	Last Year	% Change	This Year	Last Year	% Change
Ridership	Total Trips Completed*	600,878	528,845	+13.6%	571,327	475,267	+20.2%
	Total Ridership	873,601	752,442	+16.1%	822,914	672,543	+22.4%
On-Time Performance	Pick-up Primary 30 Minute	96.0%	94.0%	+2.0%	95.5%	93.5%	+2.0%
	Pick-up Primary 15 Minute	88.0%	83.0%	+5.0%	86.2%	82.2%	+4.0%
	Pick-up Broker 30 Minute	94.0%	94.0%	0.0%	93.5%	90.3%	+3.2%
	Pick-up Broker 15 Minute	81.0%	80.0%	+1.0%	79.8%	74.6%	+5.2%
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	51.0%	n/a	n/a	51.3%	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - Early*	44.0%	n/a	n/a	40.6%	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	40.0%	n/a	n/a	40.0%	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - Early*	51.0%	n/a	n/a	49.8%	n/a	n/a
Ride Time	Ride Time Variance Performance: Actual Trip Duration vs. Planned Trip Duration - At or Better Than Plan	84.0%	81.0%	+3.0%	81.5%	80.6%	+0.9%
	Average Actual Trip Duration in Minutes	36	37	-2.7%	37	35	+5.0%
	Max Ride Time Performance Primary	99.0%	98.0%	+1.0%	97.8%	98.4%	-0.7%
	Max Ride Time Performance Broker	99.0%	99.0%	0.0%	99.0%	98.6%	+0.4%
Customer Experience	Frequent Rider Experience Primary*	86.0%	n/a	n/a	85.8%	n/a	n/a
	Frequent Rider Experience Broker*	94.0%	n/a	n/a	92.9%	n/a	n/a
Provider No-Shows	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Primary	0.54	1.70	-68.2%	1.14	2.78	-59.0%
	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Broker	2.94	2.95	-0.3%	4.07	5.42	-25.0%
Customer Complaints	Passenger Complaints - Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	2.3	3.0	-23.3%	2.0	5.1	-61.3%
	Passenger Complaints - Non-Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	3.1	2.9	+6.9%	3.7	3.1	+19.4%
Call Center	Percent of Calls Answered	95.0%	93.0%	+2.0%	93.8%	89.6%	+4.3%
	Average Call Answer Speed in Seconds	59	119	-50.4%	90	161	-44.1%
Eligibility	Total Registrants	176,390	169,010	+4.4%	172,887	165,978	+4.2%

*NOTE: The reporting of Drop-off On-Time Performance and Customer Experience metrics resumed in September. The yearly data comparison is not available due to the temporary suspension of appointment time booking of trips associated with the COVID-19 pandemic which started in March 2020. Consequently, the last year's 12-Month Average rate for these two metrics cannot be calculated.

Note: 1) The percentage comparisons are the percentage point change instead of the percentage change.
2) Trip data and resulting metrics are preliminary and subject to adjustments.