

Paratransit Advisory Committee (PAC)

December 1, 2022

Meeting Minutes

Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic, the PAC a Zoom virtual meeting was conducted.

1. Welcome from PAC Leadership

Meeting was called to order by Chairperson RueZalia Watkins at 5:00pm.

2. Confirmation of participants and approval of minutes

PAC Members

Thomas Coppola, Luda Demikhovskaya, Ketrina Hazell, Jose Hernandez, Billy Mitchell, Mark Anthony Phifer (had to sign off early), Jean Ryan, Tucker Salovaara, RueZalia Watkins

Absent - Mindy Jacobson, Sharada Veerubhotla, Sharlene Kraft, Ellen Rubin

MTA/NYCT Paratransit

Tammie Francisque, Donna Fredericksen, Ami Freyberger, Eugene Griffith, Simone Harvard, Robin Hernandez, Patricia Ibarguen, Diane McFarlane, Chris Pangilinan, Nathasha Parris, Donald Raimondi, Shirley Teran-Marty

Guests

Frank Camp, John McCarthy, Juliette Michaelson

Chairperson Watkins made a motion to approve the previous meeting minutes.

3. Paratransit Dashboard AAR Report

A summary of the September 2022 operating statistics from the Paratransit Report was sent to PAC members and reviewed by VP Chris Pangilinan. A copy of the report is on page

VP Pangilinan also reviewed the MTA NYCT Monthly Customer Pulse Survey for October.

PAC Member Discussion and Feedback

Mr. Salovaara: Can we add a question regarding the satisfaction of customers shared ride?

Ms. Hazell: Can we add a question, if the reservation scheduled was within the time requested?

VP Pangilinan: Welcomed the suggestions.

Chairperson Watkins: shared her optimism regarding the data's upward trends.

Ms. Ryan: Expressed that 91% still means that thousands had problems with their trips, and we need to strive for 99%.

4. Paratransit Topic: MTA Funding

VP Pangilinan introduced John McCarthy, Chief External Relations who presented financial projection for the MTA and ways in which they are working on balancing the budget. The bottom line we are facing a crisis, but we are getting ahead of it, explaining it and trying to come-up with solutions. The key to examining this crisis is an appreciation that we cannot fail – mass transit has to work for New York to work. He acknowledged that

the members of PAC are very invested in this. Presentation was distributed to members.

PAC Member Discussion and Feedback

Mr. Hernandez: A few years ago, the MTA shifted many of the paratransit rides to Broker service and reduced some of the deficit there. Was that taken into account in the projection as the fare increases are coming in the following year? One more suggestion... We are in new world, I don't think five-day work weeks are coming back, can we tailor weekend service to reflect the demand.

Mr. McCarthy: We have already assumed fare hikes. We have already seen what you have mentioned, however there are a lot of people still using the service on those other days and we need to have that service available. If we have the support from our funding partners, we will be very bullish on growing service and attracting more customers on to the service.

Ms. Ryan: (referencing the MTA Board meeting the day before 11/30) more people were actually noting that you will get more riders if you lower the fare and maybe we would get more money from the fare collected because you would have more riders. Such as lowering the price of the fare on express buses. So many don't pay for the bus, why not make it lower so that they will pay. Will people actually pay, or just keep walking in?

Mr. McCarthy: We have looked at this a bit – allowing for a price-point where people will pay and want to use the system. I worry that people who don't pay will not pay, it is not an affordability issue because we do have programs in place (1/2 fare / Fair Fares). There is a certain amount of enforcement and encouragement and cultural shift. As far as changing the prices, we do discount programs, and we are dipping our toe more into

this (Lucky 13 on OMNY and City ticket). So, there is a correlation between affordability and usage, but that's only one of our levers. All of these issues become easier to deal with when we have the funding in place. We are hoping we don't have to go up in price.

Chairperson Watkins: I want to thank you for this briefing; however, I remain really concerned because very little of it is really tweaked for us in the paratransit community. The information is very helpful, we really need to know it and we need to share it with our constituents, but we also need to be able to tell them what this information means in terms of the future of paratransit services. Maybe the Paratransit (VP, DVP) can come back with a specialized focus on what this may or may not mean for paratransit. This is a wonderful global presentation, and we are learning a lot, but we need to explore what this might mean for our ridership.

Mr. McCarthy: Understood, and to be clear, the global view of this operating agency includes Paratransit, so all of the concerns we have about reduction in service, pricing, that applies across the board, but I will talk to Chris (VP) to be assured that you are equipped with the information that is more specific.

DVP Raimondi: Paratransit services must be provided no matter what, we are demand orientated, if the demand is there, we have to provide the service.

Chairperson Watkins: Yes, when people mention cuts, or alerting this or maybe changing a component or looking at the timing of the services, I know you want me to be reassured, Don, because you are so good at taking care of us. But when I hear these reports that talk about modifications, that could affect us too, pricing can affect us, all of these things can affect paratransit. I just want to make sure that we are not feeling too comfortable and complacent – not knowing what might be coming.

Mr. Salovaara: Will On-Demand be affected? It is cheaper than regular AAR.

Mr. McCarthy: We have major commitments in these areas. Everything is impacted, we do not want to go to anybody and say we are going to impact your service. Our message is to convince our government partners that this is a good investment, and we are dealing with a very different time, and we have to adapt.

5. PAC Topics: Customer Relations Discussion

Chairperson Watkins: Introduced the PAC topic as not so much a topic, but a matter of introduction of a process of doing our work. On October 11th, we met to identify what customer service might look like for us across all the service domains just to be able to have a framework to work on improving services collectively and cohesively with the MTA team.

PAC Member Discussion and Feedback

Multiple areas of service were identified by members for future focus in including the reservation process, subscription long rides, unprofessional contact with staff including drivers, agents on the phone, address' for public venues, complaints and how to submit them.

VP Pangilinan: This is a great topic. A suggestion I have... if we look at what is the entire life of a trip – from booking a trip to completion, all these steps are different interfaces with AAR and the customer. The question here is, what are the areas that could be most meaningful based on the complaint data, base on the survey, based on your experiences? What is the 80/20 rule? Where would we put 20% of our time to make 80% of the impact. That would be tremendously helpful for us to help guide AAR as

to where we can put our efforts. Because we could have an idea, but it is great to have your input too, to help us make sure we are focused on the right area that we want to improve as well.

The VP also noted that there is a difference between a funding issue and process issue. It might be helpful to identify and prioritize.

6. New/Old Business

Chairperson Watkins: noted that the dates for future meetings will be shared. She also expressed her thanks and well wishes to Paratransit Outreach team member Shirley Teran-Marty who is moving to DOB.

Meeting was adjourned at 6:30 PM.

Paratransit Report

Statistical results for the month of September 2022 are shown below.

Paratransit Operations - Monthly Operations Report Service Indicators							
Category	Performance Indicator	Current Month: September 2022			12-Month Average		
		This Year	Last Year	% Change	This Year	Last Year	% Change
Ridership	Total Trips Completed*	560,964	467,635	+20.0%	503,531	473,622	+6.3%
	Total Ridership	807,181	668,513	+20.7%	719,672	653,857	+10.1%
On-Time Performance	Pick-up Primary 30 Minute	93.0%	90.0%	+3.0%	94.4%	95.3%	-0.9%
	Pick-up Primary 15 Minute	82.0%	77.0%	+5.0%	83.4%	86.5%	-3.1%
	Pick-up Broker 30 Minute	90.0%	87.0%	+3.0%	91.1%	94.0%	-2.9%
	Pick-up Broker 15 Minute	75.0%	71.0%	+4.0%	76.7%	81.2%	-4.5%
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - Early*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - Early*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Ride Time	Ride Time Variance Performance: Actual Trip Duration vs. Planned Trip Duration - At or Better Than Plan	81.0%	79.0%	+2.0%	80.4%	85.1%	-4.7%
	Average Actual Trip Duration in Minutes	39	37	+5.4%	37	31	+20.5%
	Max Ride Time Performance Primary	97.0%	98.0%	-1.0%	97.9%	98.9%	-1.0%
	Max Ride Time Performance Broker	99.0%	99.0%	0.0%	98.6%	99.0%	-0.4%
Customer Experience	Frequent Rider Experience Primary*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Frequent Rider Experience Broker*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Provider No-Shows	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Primary	2.18	6.60	-67.0%	1.87	2.07	-9.9%
	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Broker	6.66	6.31	+5.6%	5.27	2.39	+120.3%
Customer Complaints	Passenger Complaints - Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	2.2	6.6	-66.7%	3.7	3.6	+2.6%
	Passenger Complaints - Non-Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	3.7	4.2	-11.9%	3.4	1.8	+86.9%
Call Center	Percent of Calls Answered	91.0%	87.0%	+4.0%	91.7%	92.3%	-0.7%
	Average Call Answer Speed in Seconds	149	219	-32.0%	127	111	+14.5%
Eligibility	Total Registrants	172,662	166,712	+3.6%	168,444	162,842	+3.4%

*NOTE: The Drop-off On-Time Performance and Customer Experience metrics are not available to present monthly data comparison due to the temporary suspension of appointment time booking of trips associated with the COVID-19 pandemic which started in March 2020. Consequently, the current 12-Month Average rate for these two metrics cannot be calculated.

Note: 1) The percentage comparisons are the percentage point change instead of the percentage change.
 2) Trip data and resulting metrics are preliminary and subject to adjustments.